

Cleveland Clinic Lerner College of Medicine  
of  
Case Western Reserve University

CASE WESTERN RESERVE UNIVERSITY (CWRU)  
SCHOOL OF MEDICINE

FACULTY POLICIES

AS APPLIED TO THE

CLEVELAND CLINIC LERNER COLLEGE OF MEDICINE OF CWRU

(Effective February 2009)

**CLEVELAND CLINIC LERNER COLLEGE OF MEDICINE  
OF  
CASE WESTERN RESERVE UNIVERSITY**

**FACULTY POLICIES**

**CONTENTS**

- I. Qualifications and Standards for Appointment and Promotion of Regular Faculty
  - A. General Considerations
  - B. Specific Qualifications
  
- II. Qualifications and Standards for Appointment and Promotion of Clinical Faculty
  
- III. Procedures for Appointment and Promotion of Faculty Members
  
- Appendix 1* Documentation of Accomplishments Needed for Appointment or Promotion to Associate or Professor
  
- Appendix 2* Documentation of Accomplishments Needed for Appointment to Instructor or Assistant Professor
  
- Appendix 3* Documentation of Accomplishments Needed for Appointment or Promotion to Clinical Associate or Clinical Professor
  
- Appendix 4* Documentation of Accomplishments Needed for Appointment to Clinical Instructor or Clinical Assistant Professor

# **I. QUALIFICATIONS AND STANDARDS FOR APPOINTMENT AND PROMOTION OF REGULAR FACULTY**

## **A. General Considerations**

- 1) The necessary qualifications of a candidate for faculty appointment are (a) an expert knowledge of his or her academic field and a commitment to continuing development of this competence; (b) a dedication to effective teaching; (c) a commitment to a continuing program of research or other advanced creative activity or, when more appropriate to the particular academic context, professional service activity; (d) a willingness to assume a fair share of College administrative and service tasks. Service contributions may take the form of administrative and/or clinical services.
- 2) Faculty appointments should be based on evidence that the candidate can and will continue to satisfy item (a) and two of items (b), (c) and (d) of the foregoing qualifications.
- 3) Reappointments and promotions should reflect the candidate's documented fulfillment of these qualifications and the growth of his or her corresponding contributions. It should be recognized that the creative and professional service accomplishments of the faculty may take many different forms. Thus, the evaluation of a candidate's activities should be based on his or her academic competence, teaching effectiveness, and contributions to attainment of the particular academic objectives of his or her department and the College as a whole.
- 4) All faculty appointments in the CCLCM will be in the non-tenure track at CWRU. All faculty in the CCLCM will also have a staff appointment at the Cleveland Clinic. Faculty appointments at CCLCM will terminate simultaneous with resignation, retirement or loss of employment as a staff member of the Cleveland Clinic.
- 5) Candidates for CCLCM appointment and promotion will be judged on the basis of excellence in either teaching or research or clinical service. Candidates shall be asked to identify their area of primary excellence for the purpose of appointment or promotion. All faculty appointed or promoted to associate professor or professor must, along with an area of excellence, provide evidence of acceptable contributions in one or more of the other categories of faculty activity (i.e., teaching, research, or service).
- 6) Faculty members with joint appointments as College administrative officers shall be considered for appointment and promotion on the basis of performance in both capacities. For such faculty members, as for any others, the maintenance of academic competence and teaching effectiveness shall be vital criteria. The distinctive contributions of such candidates to administrative service, however, shall be considered in combination with their research or equivalent creative activities.

- 7) It is the policy of the College not to discriminate on the basis of race, religion, sex, national origin, age, color, handicap, or any other characteristic not relevant to adequate job performance.

**B. Specific Qualifications**

Academic efforts of the faculty of the College of Medicine sustain and advance the educational and scientific goals of the College of Medicine through research, teaching, and professional service. The scholarly activities of a candidate in these three areas shall be assessed for appointment and promotion:

- 1) **Excellence in Teaching:** The candidate is expected to have expert knowledge of his or her academic field, a commitment to continuing development of this competence, and a continuing dedication to effective teaching. Teaching activities include the organization, evaluation and transmission of knowledge. Excellence in teaching includes serving as a model of professional conduct for students, residents, fellows, colleagues, and patients. Standards relating to teaching should embrace: (a) preparation and presentation of material in a well-organized, current and stimulating fashion as viewed by peers and students; (b) leadership in design, organization and/or presentation of a course, clinical program or subdivision thereof; (c) ability to evaluate and counsel students; and (d) participating in postgraduate educational activities.

Educational efforts may include but are not limited to the following activities: teaching in subject committees and small group conferences, clinical science programs, elective programs, family clinic, core and optional clerkships, ambulatory medicine, undergraduate and graduate courses in other schools of the university, graduate medical and postgraduate teaching, and serving as a student advisor or counselor.

Recognition of performance in these educational activities depends on consistent, enthusiastic participation and offering personal assistance to students or residents. Similarly, recognition for clinical teaching requires contact with students or residents over a sustained period, not limited to occasional ward rounds, demonstrations, or presentations. Such contributions, in general, include functions concerned with the planning and implementation of teaching with regard to content, depth, coverage, sequence, evaluation, and coordination. Candidates for promotion should exhibit scholarship in teaching as evidenced by careful thought regarding the purpose of teaching, the definition of realistic objectives, identification of important material to be presented, selection of the appropriate methods of presentation, the modification of teaching in light of experience, the evaluation of the teaching goals, and a willingness to engage in critical self-evaluation. Recognition will be given to original, innovative and unique contributions and published reports of such contributions. Teaching may be judged to be of high quality, however, without being innovative or original. In addition, since administration of education efforts is an integral component of the teaching process, service as a subject committee chair, area of concentration chair, core clerkship director, section leader, residency training program director, or equivalent positions, and service on educational committees constitute significant criteria for consideration.

The quality of these educational efforts will be assessed by student and resident reviews and by statements from colleagues at this and other institutions. Candidates are encouraged to submit a list of former or current students and residents who can best judge teaching efforts, along with other biographical information, for review purposes. All candidates should present a commonly organized teaching portfolio to enable better evaluation of the quantity and quality of their teaching contributions. Portfolios might include a self-report, detailing for each course or area of teaching (clerkship, training program, residency, etc.), such basic facts as the number of years involved, the primary role of the candidate, the type and number of participants, the number of contact hours per year, and special contributions that the faculty member believes he or she has made. Teaching portfolios should also include materials demonstrating the extent of the candidate's scholarship in teaching (as described in the preceding paragraph) as this may be reflected in the candidate's teaching materials, curricula, syllabi, computer programs, videotapes, teaching awards, and self-reflective statements.

For appointment or promotion to the rank of associate professor, with teaching as the primary area of achievement, candidates must present evidence of excellence in teaching and recognition of this excellence at a regional or national level. For appointment or promotion to the rank of professor, with teaching as the primary area of excellence, candidates must present evidence of sustained contributions that are recognized at the national or international level.

- 2) **Excellence in Scholarly Research:** The candidate is expected to demonstrate a commitment to a continuing program of research or other advanced creative activity. Excellence in scholarly research involves the discovery, organization, interpretation, and transmission of knowledge. The quality of the research program of an individual shall be evaluated as to the originality, depth, rigor, and thoroughness of the studies. Important discoveries, national recognition, and innovations in techniques or methods shall lend weight to the assessment. Research contributions to be evaluated include publications in scholarly or professional journals, book chapters, books, invited papers and lectures, literature reviews, case history reports, abstracts, book reviews, major reports, and other presentations. Also to be considered are professional honors, awards, and national offices; participation in research review committees of the national, state or local government and of voluntary health organizations; and service on editorial boards of scientific journals or as an examiner on specialty boards. Success in obtaining external research grants or other supportive funding shall also be considered, but is not a necessary criterion in the evaluation of research qualifications. The quality of the research efforts of individuals will be assessed through letters of evaluation of the scholarly work obtained from authorities in the field of interest of the candidate at this and other major academic institutions. A list of professional peers who can judge the merit of the research program should be submitted with other biographical material for review. The list should include colleagues who have not been associated with the candidate as well as those who have been associated with the candidate. In addition, the candidate is invited to submit a brief (1 page or less) description of his or her research accomplishments.

While the evaluation of research accomplishments has traditionally focused on the faculty member's individual achievements, including first and senior authorships and funding as principal investigator, the present and future of science will place increasing emphasis on interdisciplinary research team science. Where relevant, therefore, a faculty member's contributions to interdisciplinary research team science shall also be considered. Such factors as originality, creativity, indispensability, and unique abilities may be considered when making this evaluation. The candidate is invited to submit a brief description of his/her role in the team effort, and statements from the principal investigator, the director of the project, and others with first-hand knowledge as to the role of the candidate.

Appointment or promotion to the rank of associate professor or professor, with research as the primary area of excellence, requires that the research program be recognized on a national or international level.

- 3) **Professional Service** accomplishments are indispensable for the attainment of the academic goals of the College of Medicine, and the quality of this activity shall be assessed for candidates for appointment and promotion. The professional service accomplishments of faculty members may take different forms as defined by the objectives of the various departments. Professional service consists of both administrative and clinical service, and all candidates should demonstrate a continuing commitment to contributions to administrative and service tasks.
  - a. **Administrative Service:** All faculty will be expected to make administrative service contributions. Examples of administrative service include but are not limited to (a) significant administrative contributions to the department or hospital; (b) significant contributions to the College; (c) participation in departmental, hospital or College committees; (d) professional memberships and activities and services related to professional societies; (e) participation in research review committees of the state and federal government and of voluntary health organizations; (f) service on editorial boards of scientific journals or as an examiner on specialty boards; (g) community health efforts including participation in educational and scientific committees of the Academy of Medicine and the Ohio State Medical Association; (h) participation in educational and professional society committees or committees of national, state, and local voluntary health agencies; and (i) leadership in community health organizations.
  - b. **Clinical Service:** For those faculty engaged in it, excellence of clinical service will be recognized and evaluated as part of the combined achievements that qualify for faculty appointment and promotion. Excellence shall be judged by both objective and subjective measures. The determination of the level of clinical excellence achieved by a candidate for appointment or promotion may include consideration of materials not limited to the following: (1) specialty and subspecialty board certification and recertification; (2) outcomes data, if available, including mortality and morbidity data, comparative length of stay data, and surveys of patient satisfaction; (3) documentation of a reputation for excellence in one's clinical specialty as evidenced by membership or fellowship in professional societies, especially in leadership positions, and awards for clinical service or patient satisfaction; (4) documentation of scholarly activities that

influence the practice of medicine nationally; (5) recognition as an authority as indicated by consultations, invited lectures and seminars, visiting professorships, and invited writings; and (6) letters from those such as department chairs or division directors who have directly observed the candidate's clinical work. In addition, letters of reference as to the candidate's degree of excellence in clinical service can be provided by students and residents who have been closely associated with the faculty member during their clinical work.

- c. For appointment or promotion to the rank of associate professor, with clinical service as the primary area of achievement, candidates must present evidence of recognition of this excellence at a regional or national level. For appointment or promotion to the rank of professor, with clinical service as the primary area of excellence, candidates must present evidence of sustained contributions that are recognized at the national or international level.

- 4) **Exceptional Qualifications:** The balance of accomplishments in teaching, research, and professional service may vary considerably from one candidate to another and exceptional qualifications in one or two areas may partially compensate for less prominent accomplishments in another. There will be unusual instances when research accomplishments are of such high caliber that this activity alone will be sufficient for appointment or promotion. Similarly, there will be unusual circumstances when involvement in teaching is of such excellence in both quality and quantity and the impact of these contributions on the local environment so great that this activity alone will be sufficient for appointment or promotion. Professional service activities shall be weighed in the assessment of a candidate for appointment or promotion and an outstanding record in these activities may on occasion make up for less prominent accomplishments in either teaching or research. Administrative and clinical service contributions may be judged in the assessment of candidates for appointment or promotion, especially when such contributions are clearly and directly related to teaching and/or research, as in the case of service as a subject committee chair, core clerkship director, section leader, or research training director, or as a member of an educational committee.

For appointment or promotion to the rank of associate professor, the candidate must present evidence of excellence in either (1) teaching or clinical service and recognition of this excellence at a regional or national level or (2) research and recognition of the research program at a national level.

For appointment or promotion to the rank of professor, candidates must present evidence of sustained contributions in their research, teaching, or clinical service that is recognized at the national or international level. Along with an area of excellence, faculty must also provide evidence of acceptable contributions in one or more of the other categories of faculty activity (i.e., teaching, research, or service).

## **II. QUALIFICATIONS AND STANDARDS FOR APPOINTMENT OR PROMOTION OF CLINICAL FACULTY**

This category is applicable to staff whose primary efforts are in the community and devoted to clinical practice and/or clinical administration and leadership or for whom traditional academic contributions are part-time and/or voluntary.

Appointment or promotion to the clinical faculty is given on the basis of the candidate's combined past achievements and potential for future contributions in the areas of research, teaching, administrative service, clinical leadership and/or clinical service that, in combination, are essential to the mission of the College, the School of Medicine, and the University. All types of professional activities will be considered as contributing to the overall qualifications for clinical faculty appointments and promotion.

These contributions and achievements shall be assessed using the same standards and procedures as those applied to full-time faculty. However, the level of achievement, the past time commitment demonstrated, and the duration of service shall be considered in the evaluation. Superior patient care, clinical leadership, contributions to student or resident teaching, educational administrative efforts, and participation in community health organizations will lend weight to the evaluation.

Appointment or promotion to the rank of clinical professor requires demonstration of an appropriate combination of special merit with respect to clinical, professional, and/or academic accomplishment. Appointment or promotion to this rank shall be a senior but not a terminal appointment, and continued effort for the College is expected thereafter. In addition to the achievements expected of all clinical faculty, the professional excellence of candidates for promotion to the rank of clinical professor should be recognized on a regional or national level.



### III. PROCEDURES FOR APPOINTMENT AND PROMOTION

In accordance with the policies of Case Western Reserve University, all full-time faculty appointments and promotions are effective only upon approval by the University's Board of Trustees and after prior review by the University Provost and the Dean of the CRWU School of Medicine. Faculty appointments within the CCLCM may be at the level of instructor, assistant professor, associate professor or full professor within the regular (non-tenure) or clinical categories.

Nominations for faculty appointments and promotions within the CCLCM will be initiated by the Cleveland Clinic department chairman. The candidate is responsible for collecting all supportive material for review by the CCLCM Committee on Appointments and Promotions (CAP). This material will include a current curriculum vitae, the candidate's self-description, key reprints, and list of referees, including external referees, colleagues, and current or former students/trainees (*Appendices 1 - 4*). The candidate will submit this material together with a nomination letter to the CCLCM Office of Faculty Affairs and, if the nomination file is complete, it will be sent to the CCLCM CAP for formal review.

After completing its evaluation, the CCLCM CAP will prepare a written statement detailing the basis of its recommendation and the vote of the Committee. Recommendations in favor of faculty appointments and promotions will then be managed as follows:

- 1) When the recommendation is for appointment or promotion to the level of associate professor or full professor (regular faculty), the file will be sent for further review to the Case Western Reserve University School of Medicine Committee on Appointments and Promotions (CWRU CAP). Recommended appointments from the CWRU CAP will be sent for further approval to the Dean of the CWRU School of Medicine, the CWRU Provost, the CWRU President, and the CWRU Board of Trustees.
- 2) When the recommendation is for appointment at the level of instructor, assistant professor, or for all ranks with the title modified by "clinical," the file will be sent for further review directly to the Dean of the CWRU School of Medicine, the CWRU Provost, the CWRU President, and the CWRU Board of Trustees.

Following review of a candidate's nomination file, if the recommendation from the CCLCM CAP is unfavorable, a written statement from the Committee will be forwarded promptly to the Cleveland Clinic department chairman who may appeal the decision. The appeal usually involves a meeting with the CCLCM CAP to permit a full discussion of the recommendation. The CCLCM CAP then re-evaluates the nomination in light of any new information made available during the appeal and writes an addendum to the original statement indicating whether or not the appeal has produced a change in the committee's recommendation.

A secondary faculty appointment in the CCLCM may be obtained for individuals holding a primary faculty appointment in the CWRU School of Medicine who are contributing to the College's activities. These appointments will require sequential approval by the Cleveland Clinic department chairman, the CCLCM CAP, and the Dean of the CWRU School of Medicine.

## *Appendix 1*

### **Documentation of Accomplishments Needed for Consideration for Appointment or Promotion to Associate Professor or Professor (Regular Faculty)**

Nominations for appointment or promotion to the level of associate professor or professor must be accompanied by the following materials:

- A. A nomination letter from the Cleveland Clinic department chairman discussing the qualifications of the candidate including teaching, research, professional service contributions, landmark discoveries or innovations, and the candidate's relationship to the department's academic strategy.
- B. Candidate curriculum vitae and bibliography which should include the following information:
  - 1) Personal data: name; education with dates, places, and types of degree; postgraduate training with dates and places.
  - 2) Professional appointments: dates, names of departments and institutions, and the rank of the appointment.
  - 3) Licensure and board certification when appropriate.
  - 4) Membership in professional societies.
  - 5) Honor and awards.
  - 6) Professional service: service on study sections, editorial boards, professional societies, advisory groups, etc.
  - 7) Service on medical school, hospital or university committees, including the names of the committees and dates of service.
  - 8) Past and present teaching activities: teaching of medical, graduate, postgraduate and undergraduate students and house officers, as well as teaching at postgraduate or continuing medical education symposia, visiting professorships or service on intramural or extramural education committees. The documentation should cover the frequency of the contributions, the number of actual contact hours and additional input such as planning, evaluation and coordination. A listing of former graduate students or trainees and their present status may also be helpful. It is the responsibility of each faculty member to maintain a current listing of all teaching contributions.
  - 9) Past and present research support: this list should include the granting agency, duration of the grant, title, the principal investigator, the percent effort of the nominee, and the total direct costs awarded. Applications pending review should be included. If desired, research support may be listed separately as an addendum to the curriculum vitae.

- 10) Bibliography: references should include the names of all authors, titles of articles, and inclusive pages. Abstracts, presentations, chapters, books should be listed separately, as should peer-reviewed papers, and articles which have been submitted or are in preparation.
- C. Candidate's self-description comprising a brief (2 pages or less) discussion of the candidate's teaching and research and service accomplishments.
- D. Reprints: three to five key reprints reflecting the candidate's most significant contributions.
- E. Letters from external referees: These referees should be recognized experts in the nominee's field of interest and should be carefully chosen in order to provide an independent, detailed assessment of the candidate's work and scholarly contributions. External referees should be individuals who have not been collaborators, mentors or other persons with whom the candidate has had a direct working relationship. A minimum of eight letters should be requested for appointment or promotion to associate professor and a minimum of ten should be requested for appointment or promotion to professor.
- F. Letters from colleagues who can clarify the candidate's role in collaborative research projects, or who can comment on the quantity and quality of the candidate's teaching and service contributions. Faculty colleagues who can evaluate teaching might include teaching committee chairs, curriculum coordinators, course directors, and clerkship directors. For candidates who teach residents, a letter from the department program director should be included. Colleagues who can evaluate service contributions might include chairs or other members of committees and/or professional societies on which the candidate has served. Two letters should be requested from individuals in this category.
- G. Letters from current or former students or trainees who can be asked to evaluate the candidate's teaching. Four letters should be requested from individuals in this category.
- H. Proof of terminal degree in the form of an MD and/or PhD diploma.

## *Appendix 2*

### **Documentation of Accomplishments Needed for Consideration for Appointment to Instructor or Assistant Professor (Regular Faculty)**

Nominations for appointments to the level of instructor or assistant professor must be accompanied by a nomination letter from the Cleveland Clinic department chairman, a curriculum vitae and bibliography, candidate's self-description, three to five key reprints and proof of terminal degree, as outlined above for nominees at the level of associate or full professor. Three letters of reference are required for candidates nominated for a junior-level faculty appointment. Letters can be obtained from any combination of external references, colleagues, students or trainees. A reference letter may not be obtained from the nominator of the appointment.

### *Appendix 3*

#### **Documentation of Accomplishments Needed for Consideration for Appointment or Promotion to Clinical Associate or Clinical Professor**

Nominations for appointments to the level of clinical associate or clinical professor must be accompanied by a nomination letter from the Cleveland Clinic department chairman, curriculum vitae and bibliography, candidate's self-description, and proof of terminal degree. Reprints are not required. A total of five letters of reference are required for candidates nominated at this level. Three letters should be from external senior faculty references who are the same rank or higher for which you are applying. Two additional letters can be obtained from any combination of external references, colleagues, students or trainees. A reference letter may not be obtained from the nominator of the appointment.

## *Appendix 4*

### **Documentation of Accomplishments Needed for Consideration for Appointment to Clinical Instructor or Clinical Assistant Professor**

Nominations for appointments to the level of clinical instructor or clinical assistant professor must be accompanied by a nomination letter from the Cleveland Clinic department chairman, a curriculum vitae and bibliography, and proof of terminal degree. A personal self-description, letters of reference and reprints are not required.